



Hamilton vs Jefferson

Evaluating Sources

Objective

To what extent does *Hamilton* the musical accurately depict the debate between Hamilton and Jefferson over the National Bank of the United States?

Directions: Review the chart below carefully and use it to answer the analysis question below.

Issues	Hamilton (Federalist Party)	Jefferson (Democratic-Republican Party)
Federalism (division of power)	Strong central government, weak state governments	Strong state governments, weak central government
Tariff (taxes) on imported goods	US government should tax imported goods to generate revenue and pay off debts. This encourages people to buy American made goods and encourages manufacturing.	States should not be subjected to a national tax of any kind. There should be no tariffs on imports.
US Economy	Manufacturing, the US government should support manufacturing	Farming is the main economic activity that the US should protect and support
Interpretation of the Constitution	Elastic clause allows for <u>loose interpretation</u> of the Constitution	<u>Strict interpretation</u> , government shouldn't go beyond what is outlined in Constitution
Whiskey Rebellion	National government has the power to issue taxes to raise revenue. The Whiskey Rebellion represents a plot to promote states rights and was put down properly.	National government should leave taxation to the states. In the Whiskey Rebellion, the government used the army to put down legitimate protest to an unfair government tax.

Analysis Question: Based on the information in this chart, predict what Hamilton and Jefferson would do in the following scenario:

There is a proposal to create a National Bank of the United States. The power to create this bank is not explicitly listed in the US Constitution, but those who support it cite the elastic clause (which suggests that congress can do anything necessary and proper for the functioning of our nation) as a reason why this bank would be constitutional. Those who oppose it believe it is an expansion of Federal power therefore dangerous.

- Who do you think would support the bank - Hamilton or Jefferson and why?

Hamilton - constitution allows for loose interpretation

- Who do you think would be against the bank - Hamilton or Jefferson and why?


Jefferson - not written in constitution cant do it

Historical Context - Cabinet Battle #1 from *Hamilton* (2015) - a Broadway Musical

In July 2008, while Lin-Manuel Miranda was on vacation in Mexico, Lin-Manuel took on a little light reading in the form of Ron Chernow's 800-page New York Times best-selling biography, *Alexander Hamilton*, chronicling the life of the first Treasury Secretary of the United States. Lin-Manuel was captivated by the story of Hamilton's life and how the very human struggles of the American Revolution continue to manifest themselves in today's society. From here, an idea grew to tell the story of Hamilton through contemporary song stylings, but the shape of that project was still a long way from being fully-formed. At the time, it was conceived as a concept album to be known as "The Hamilton Mixtape." Eventually, this became *Hamilton*, a Broadway musical that debuted in New York City in 2015.

Directions

One song from the second act of the musical, *Cabinet Battle # 1*, reviews the debate between Thomas Jefferson and Alexander Hamilton over the creation of the National Bank. Listen to the song twice, using the prompts below to guide you. When you are done, compare the lyrics of the song to the primary source documents provided to evaluate the songs as a source of historical documentation.

→ Song  **First Listen:** Cabinet Battle # 1: Listen to the song *Cabinet Battle #1* from *Hamilton* the Musical by Lin Manuel-Miranda (2015). The first time you listen to it, jot your thoughts down in the box below. Use the questions below to help you shape your notes and reflections.

- What do you hear?
- Based on this song, who do you think supports the bank?
- Based on your first listen to this song, what do you think the relationship was like between Hamilton and Jefferson?